

Clarification Request

References: Functionality Checklist 23.0 and ANSI/ASHRAE Standard 135-2020

Date of BTL-WG Response: 03-August-2023

Background:

In functionality checklist, under DM-LM-A we could see support for read-only properties check name.

Device Management - List Manipulation – A		
X	R	Base Requirements
X	C ¹	Supports adding and removing Device / Device_Address_Binding entries
X	C ¹	Supports adding and removing Device / Active_COV_Subscriptions entries
X	C ¹	Supports adding and removing Device / Slave_Address_Binding entries
X	C ¹	Supports adding and removing entries in proprietary list properties of primitive datatypes
X	C ^{1,2}	Supports adding and removing Network Port / Slave_Address_Binding entries
X	C ^{1,3}	Supports adding and removing Device / Active_COV_Multiple_Subscriptions entries
¹ At least one of these options must be supported to claim support for this BIBB. ² Protocol_Revision 17 or higher must be claimed. ³ Protocol_Revision 18 or higher must be claimed.		

After receiving AddListElement and RemoveListElement request for above yellow highlighted Read-Only properties TD will always respond with "Error Class = PROPERTY, Error Code = WRITE_ACCESS_DENIED" instead of BACnet-SimpleACK-PDU.

A device can claim just the "Supports adding and removing entries in proprietary list properties of primitive datatypes" to claim this BIBB.

Our interpretation:

We feel that the above yellow highlighted Read-Only properties should not be present in the functionality checklist.

A device should not be able to claim only "Supports adding and removing entries in proprietary list properties of primitive datatypes" to claim this BIBB.

Questions:

1. Is our interpretation correct of removing Checknames under DM-LM-A?
2. Should the checklist be changed to not allow a device to claim only "Supports adding and removing entries in proprietary list properties of primitive datatypes" to claim this BIBB?

Response:

1. Yes
2. Yes